

Steering Committee Meeting Minutes
09.00 – 13.00 hrs, Thursday 14th June 2007

Present:

Moses Olenesselle
Sally Capper - SC
David Erickson - DE
Charles Foley - CF
Clive Jones - CJ
Edward Loure - EL
Alias Morindat -AM
Jackson Muro – JM
(non-voting representative)

Janemary Ntalwila -JN
Daudi Petersen - DP
Edward Porokwa – EP
(non-voting representative)
Katherine Snyder - KS

Also present:

Andrew Williams - AW

Not present -

- ex-officio:

Alan Rodgers - AR
Elizabeth Singleton - ES

- apologies from:

Damian Bell - DB
George Jambiya - GJ
Charles Meshack - CM

1 STEERING COMMITTEE ADMINISTRATION

1.1 AM -Review and acceptance of Minutes from the Steering Committee held on 25th January, 2007

Presented by AW

The minutes of the Steering Committee held on 25th January 2007 were read and approved by the Steering Committee members present. The following observations and requests were made:

- An attendance list be appended to the minutes
- Actions and a timeframe for their implementation be included in future minutes
- The minutes be signed by the Chairman and Secretary.

1.2 Steering Committee management

Presented by CF

The Steering Committee needs to function better, be more aware of the Secretariat's work and guide the TNRF Secretariat. To date the Coordinator has been trying to manage the Committee, but the Committee is not meeting regularly enough and attendance has been less than it should. It is recommended that quorum be increased to 8 people, and that the Committee should meet quarterly. In addition, David Erickson's departure leaves a position open, and it is suggested that Keith Roberts of Friedkin Conservation Foundation be temporarily allowed to stand in for David Erickson – in representing hunting tourism interests.

Comments:

It might be useful to find a support person to help organise and manage the Steering Committee. The Committee should take responsibility for itself – and organise its own meeting schedule and record keeping.

Fixed dates are essential for getting the Steering Committee to meet.

The Steering Committee shouldn't be involved at all in its own organisation and functioning – TNRF Secretariat should be stronger on its administration, not least its management of the Steering Committee.

Management sub-Committee needs to function on a more regular basis – currently its members are struggling to meet – see agenda point 3 below.

Action Points:

The Advisory Board – i.e. Management sub-Committee should begin meeting regularly;
The Steering Committee should meet on a regular quarterly basis from now on.
The Steering Committee quorum will be decided at a future juncture
The Steering Committee vacancy issue will be left for further consideration. In the meantime, Keith Roberts will be invited to attend on behalf David Erickson without voting rights.

2 GENERAL REPORT FOR LAST 4 MONTH PERIOD

2.1 Tanzania Forestry Working Group (TFWG)

Presented by AW

The TFWG received funding from GTZ of TShs 19,565,755 to develop a two year project on communications and advocacy in terms of increasing awareness and helping address illegal logging issues in southern Tanzania. The proposal is now at an advanced stage, having been collaboratively developed by more than 15 organisations (as members of the TFWG). Government has been invited to attend, but only did so at one meeting, as it is thought that the sensitivity of the issue made it difficult for FBD staff to attend.

2.2 Community Forums (CF)

Presented by AW

Community Forums have now been started with meetings in Simanjiro, Ngorongoro and Longido Districts in collaboration with Ujamaa Community Resource Trust. The objective of the community forums is to support the development of customary institutions to resolve outstanding land and natural resource conflicts. An overall objective is develop a community-based rangelands network which acts as a learning network and which is able to take key natural resource management and related advocacy issues up.

Comments:

There was a reservation raised about the process setting off an eruption of political activism that would detract from the purpose of the community forums focussing on land and natural resource management issues.

Another reservation raised was the initiative 'stepping on the toes' of local political struggles and power-plays, and a need for careful and measured engagement.

AW's response

Both these comments are a significant risk – and strong facilitation and good guidance will be required to minimise partisan political subversion of the purpose of the community forums.

2.3 Community-based Tourism Working Group (CBTWG)

Following strong interest, a two afternoon CBT Info Fair was held in partnership with the Karibu Tourism and Travel Fair supported by the Conservation Resource Centre. The event was well attended – with 60 people on the first day and over 100 on the second. Feedback surveys from the Fair indicated an overwhelming wish for more events and information like this, including a toolkit. There was strong demand for the launch of a working group which 39 per cent of respondents said they would be willing to contribute to.

2.4 Rangelands and Livelihoods Task Force (RLTF)

Presented by AW

The RLTF has been going through a quiet period and has not met, despite partners wanting that it reconvene. The key constraint has been finding a suitable person to facilitate the work of the task force. Despite two rounds of interviews, and after one candidate was offered the post but withdrew at short notice to pursue a career in politics, a final candidate has yet to be found. Rather than hire a person who might not be the most appropriate for the position, a head-hunting

process is underway – which is necessarily slow and protracted. Once a suitable candidate is identified, it is anticipated that the Task Force will become very active again.

TNRF received funding from WCS AHEAD (USD 25,000) to undertake a research project on rangelands and livelihoods issues in Tanzania focussing on pastoralism. Appropriate consultants are currently being identified and short-listed.

2.5 Membership services

Presented by AW

The Secretariat will be launching an initiative to expand TNRF membership and improve services to members – with the re-launch of bi-monthly meetings. In addition, a survey will be undertaken of member needs in the forthcoming months.

2.6 Communications – new website, General Annual Report, WG brochures

Presented by AW

An application has been made to the Sigrid Rausing Trust for a communications grant in order to drastically improve TNRF's communications. In the meantime a new website is underdevelopment to support this process, which will enable much more efficient exchange of information and provide a strong institutional focus for TNRF's Secretariat in terms membership services, reporting and monitoring and evaluation. In addition, an Annual General Report has been produced which will be a useful aid to improving TNRF's image and people's understanding of the organisation, a hopefully a useful fund-raising tool. A new TNRF brochure will be developed, and if needed, brochures for each working group.

2.7 Administration and Human Resource Management

Presented by AW

Cassian Sianga – has been doing well in terms of facilitating the TFWG and has been recently supported by a consultant Freya St John. Unfortunately Cassian has not been able to contribute much to fundraising for his position, and core funds continued to be used to cover his costs.

Julius Achiula – has struggled to engage well with the community forums – in major part due to his different ethnic origin to Maasai communities which he has been working together with UCRT. When he was hired, it was anticipated that his work would have a wider focus across Tanzania, but it became quickly apparent that a more focussed approach was required to bring about tangible and productive developments in playing his role.

Nai Elibariki – has grown into her position very well – and is becoming an effective financial administrator. Currently she is supervised by Peter Robert a CPA-qualified accountant from PINGOs Forum – and this arrangement has worked well.

New staff recruitment has not proceeded very well. Following advertisements and recruitment processes for three posts – Communications Officer, Economic and Environment Policy Officer, and Rangelands and Livelihoods Officer – these positions still have not been filled.

3 MANAGEMENT SUB-COMMITTEE

3.1 Discussion of the proceedings and minutes of the meeting held on 1st March, 2007 at 2pm at the Arusha Coffee Lodge

Presented by DE

Attending: David Erickson, Katherine Snyder, Charles Foley, Daudi Peterson, Sally Capper, Clive Jones

Recommendations & Discussion

- **The need for regular/systematic reporting by the Coordinator to the entire Steering Committee**

While it is important not to over burden the Coordinator with extraneous tasks, there is a strong need for all SC members to be aware of what's happening at certain organizational levels. This is especially critical when it comes to financial obligations/responsibilities as well as organizational growth; staffing, space, institutional memory, etc.

The SC is the de facto "Board" and as such has legal and fiduciary responsibilities. For SC members to be unaware of such TNRF issues poses a potential risk to the SC individuals as well as the organization as a whole.

Specific administration and issue oriented, regularly time scheduled reporting is required. This reporting requires incorporation into the Coordinator TOR to provide a monitoring tool for the SC and a performance review opportunity for the Management Sub-committee.

- **The need for the formalization of the Management Sub-Committee**

More work on this issue needs to be done in specific consultation with the Coordinator. Flexible guidelines and procedures are required to enable the evaluation of the strengths and weakness of the individual performing the Coordinators role. These guidelines and procedures should, at the same time, ensure adherence to overall organizational norms as well safeguarding the future of the institution; the people performing the SC and Coordinator roles now are not going to be the same in 5 years time.

Another issue that came to light from this discussion was that the Coordinator requires regular management feedback, but should not be hampered by prolonged Committee deliberation. There is a need to balance micro & macro management and one option is the possibility for the Coordinator to develop a "advisor" type relationship with several SC members who can provide more timely feedback. This would not supplant Sub-Committee or Full Committee reporting/responsibilities, but would allow for the Coordinator to "check-in" more frequently.

The following two recommendations are closely interrelated.

- **The need for the Coordinator to have "quality" administrative support**

This need has been recognized for a long time and was the first position to be hired for the Secretariat. However, it is also one of the more difficult jobs to fill for any organization. TNRF is in a phase of rapid growth and program activities expand, so do administrative tasks. It is critical that the coordinator be free to coordinate rather than be tied down by routine administrative tasks. This led to a subsequent recommendation, listed below:

- **The need for the Coordinator to come up with a short/medium term plan to "load balance" administrative tasks within the Secretariat**

Granular administrative tasks can be burdensome even for the most adept and experienced manager. In any organization, the right "load balancing" must be found so that certain tasks and functions can be carried out efficiently without grinding down staff moral. From our discussion we identified that these tasks, while critical at this juncture, are occupying the Coordinator to a degree which is negatively impacting his ability to focus on important "vision" and "program" activities—where his real strengths lie.

So to address the issue in the short to medium term, the Coordinator, with help from selected SC Members, needs to do an assessment and make recommendations on how to "farm out" some of the admin tasks to the various Secretariat staff, existing and coming on line, so as to unburden himself and streamline process.

For the long term, the secretariat needs to have a high-calibre "office manager" or "administrative assistant" in place who can take on more of the routine admin duties. This may require additional recruitment for which funding will need to be sourced.

- **The need to review the job description for the Coordinator & for establishing a performance appraisal system.**

It was noted frequently that there is the need to think both about the current Coordinator as well as any & all future Coordinators. Given the rapid growth of TNRF and the specific skill sets of

the current coordinator, we thought it would be prudent to review his current job description together with him and “tweak” in such a way so that basics are covered while at the same time strengths are supported.

This then reflects on the need to develop an appropriate performance evaluation for the Coordinator position based upon the reviewed TOR. Ideally, this process would ultimately be managed by the Management Sub-Committee with inputs from the entire SC and available (in some form) to the Membership.

- **The need for regular dialog between the Coordinator and the SC (or representatives) in terms of Secretariat workload.**

This resolution bridges several issues, specifically in regards to the Coordinator having a “adviser” or some other supportive oversight. At this stage of precipitous growth it is very easy for the Secretariat to become overloaded with work (both critical and non-critical issues). It is important to provide an opportunity for perspective to be gleaned and engagement in issues to be carefully selected, especially given that TNRF is a “member” organization and should be driven by the needs of the membership.

There is a need for a mechanism that will enable the Coordinator to be able to check-in with the SC on a regular basis to ensure that, if emerging issues are to be engaged, they are in-line with the strategic plan as approved by the SC and Membership.

How this is to happen is not yet clear: could it be a sub-committee which reviews program decisions or should this be left at the discretion of the Coordinator? There is no doubt that, currently, the Coordinator needs a lot of room for manoeuvre as TNRF is still building towards “critical mass.”

- **The need for the Secretariat and the SC to have an Annual Planning Schedule**

From the experience with the AGM and looking forward to other, future activities and required reporting there is a strong need for an annual planning schedule so no one is caught off guard.

- **The need for the SC to have Bylaws in place governing and legitimizing the functions of the SC and all sub-committees.**

- **The need for the SC to manage it's own SC meetings**

In discussing issues related to the Coordinator, it was made clear on many occasions that the SC must become a functional body and begin to take responsibility for itself on several levels and with certain matters. TNRF will never be able to mature unless this starts to happen.

3.2 Functioning of Management Sub-Committee;

Presented by DE

Subsequent to the first Management Sub-Committee meeting on 1st March, unfortunately there has been no further meeting.

Action Point

KS agreed to volunteer to coordinate the Management Sub-Committee which would consist of SC, JN, CJ and KS.

3.3 Coordinator performance management;

Presented by AW/DE

The Coordinator's performance needs to be assessed and a performance management process instituted as soon as possible for the TNRF Secretariat, once the Management Sub-Committee meets.

3.4 Steering Committee resources and planning (incl. briefing on new SC files)

Presented by AW

The Secretariat will improve the level of information provided to the Steering Committee. In this regard, Steering Committee folders have been produced to enable Steering Committee members keep track of TNRF business through information that will be provided at future Steering Committee meetings. IN addition, the new website will have secure dedicated Steering Committee pages and a discussion forum viewable and useable by Steering Committee members only. Lastly, Steering Committee members will be able to track employee's whereabouts, in line with the Secretariat's planned activities.

4 FINANCE SUB-COMMITTEE

4.1 Discussion of the proceedings and minutes of the meeting held on 8th March, 2007 and financial status of TNRF;

Presented by CF

A meeting was held by the finance sub-committee on Friday 9th March, to examine the income sources and expenditures for the current year, 2007. We covered a number of main issues:

- 1) Income/expenses for core budget for 2007
- 2) Income/expenses for project budget for 2007
- 3) Growth strategy for TNRF and how that would impact future expenses
- 4) Other potential funding sources

▪ Core costs

The core costs cover all operating and administrative costs, as well as the salaries of the main administrative personnel. Total core costs for this year are approximately Tsh 99 million. In addition there is a TShs 12.6 million deficit carried over from last year, so overall costs are TShs 111.6 million. There is also an outstanding balance of TShs 1.5 million owed by WCST (which will be paid very shortly) and \$6000 owed by WWF for work carried out by TNRF last year, both of which we are assuming (for accounting purposes) will be paid. Andrew is pressuring WWF to pay this amount, but there is no indication to when it will be forthcoming.

There is also a dispute between TNRF and WCST over TShs 4.2 million that WCST claims TNRF owes (or needs to produce receipts for) and which TNRF claims is not owed. Andrew says there is no legal basis for WCST's demand and TNRF will not have to pay this amount.

The total guaranteed income this year is approximately TShs 53.5 million, so there is currently a shortfall of TShs 58 million. A large proportion of this shortfall c. TShs 38 million might come from the Bradley Fund for the Environment via SCF, though Andrew will not receive news about this funding until later this month. We expected the BFE to provide reliable long term funding to TNRF, but due to unforeseen circumstances at SCF this source of funding is no longer guaranteed and we should not hold much store in them providing significant funds in the future. There are several other sources of funding that might be used to cover the deficit. A large grant was submitted to the Sigrid Rausing Trust, which would provide approximately TShs 38 million to cover core costs. A further \$5000 might be saved from a grant from the Wilson Fund, and WCS has \$17,000 that might also be available for covering core costs. We will have to see which grants materialise to know how financially stable we are likely to be this year. In all likelihood all core costs will be covered without need to prune expenses.

Andrew pointed out that Cassian's salary is currently covered by core costs and this should be moved to project expenses. The success of the Forestry Working Group suggests that there should be good opportunities for raising this money from other sources. A grant for \$10,000 was submitted recently to the IUCN to cover part of Cassian's salary.

The grant to the Sigrid Rausing trust is for a total of \$68,000 and includes a salary for the new communications post. Andrew considers this post to be crucial and has found a very competent individual who would be well suited to the job. The problem is the salary for that person would be almost \$30,000 per year, which is not only a large sum in itself, but also considerably more than Andrews current salary. We had a lengthy debate on the merits of this, which should be

continued by the steering committee. We suggested that unless significant funds materialize this year (preferably significant long-term funds), then we might have to forgo this position at present until our financial base is more solid. Other possibilities include hiring a competent administrator (for significantly less than the suggested salary for the communications officer), which would free Andrew to take on some of the communications responsibilities until such time as further funding became available. These different options can be explored further at a later date when our financial situation becomes more apparent.

▪ **Project costs.**

The majority of project costs have been covered for this year. This includes the salary for the community conservation officer (don't remember the official title), rangelands officer, and the economics officer (again don't remember his title) if and when a suitable candidate is found. The salary for a putative human wildlife coordinator would also be fully funded from outside sources.

▪ **TNRF growth.**

Andrew would like to grow TNRF to core staff that would cover most of our main areas of interest. These positions would be as follows: coordinator, administrator, communications officer, forest officer, rangelands officer, community conservation officer, economics officer, and human wildlife conflict officer. Currently 5 of the 8 positions are filled, and there is guaranteed financing for the economics officer and probable financing for the HWC officer. That only leaves the position of communications officer unfunded and unfilled. The steering committee have suggested that another administrative officer might also be a necessity in the long run. Once these staff are in place Andrew would like to see a period of consolidation when long term funding for these positions would be sought.

▪ **Other potential funding sources.**

Andrew suggested having a voluntary TNRF members fee to raise funds for core costs. We briefly discussed the role of other steering committee members in leveraging funds from their organisations (or their contacts), though this has been tried without too much success in the past, and only a few members are in a position to do this.

4.2 Financial Review and Strategy – the consolidated financial plan

Presented by AW

Currently TNRF does not have a financial strategy to help develop a strong long-term financial outlook for the organisation. A consolidated financial plan has been developed. In addition, efforts have been taken to diversify TNRF's donor base – as below:

4.3 Report on fundraising

Presented by AW

- Sigrid Rausing Trust – an application has been made to the Trust for a fully funded communications position (USD 70,000, including outputs) – and the Trust will confirm in July whether it will fund or not. The visiting consultants were very positive and supportive.
- IUCN Forests Forever – an application was made to cover the Forest Programme Officer's costs as a stop-gap measure for developing longer-term independent funding. The application was not successful, as the awards were all allocated to projects in West Africa.
- Bradley Fund for the Environment – have confirmed that they will grant USD 30,000 for this year.
- Norwegian Embassy – we are partnering with WWF-Tz as the lead in an application process to the Norwegian Embassy to secure funds for a civil society initiative – the process is still at a preliminary stage.
- Norwegian People's Aid – has indicated that it would like to fund TNRF for another for years at a slightly higher level – and we will be partnering with NPA Tanzania to develop this process.
- DfID – a trial application has been put into DfID as part of a five partner consortium led by TNRF for 3 million pounds over five years (USD200,000 per year per organisation).
- Packard Foundation – a visited by a consultant working for the Packard Foundation was facilitated by TNRF. The Foundation are interested in developing a 10 year USD100million

project focussing on East Africa (possibly) – and particularly looking at innovative ways to change /drive policy at the Environment and Development interface.

- GTZ – granted TNRF TShs 19million for the development of a forest governance communications and advocacy campaign.

5 ANNUAL GENERAL MEETING

5.1 -Review of Annual General Meeting and AGM minutes

This agenda item was postponed by agreement to a future date to fall before the next AGM, as part of the planning process for the AGM.

6 SECRETARIAT EXPANSION AND LOGISTICS

6.1 Outcomes of interviews for Rangelands and Livelihoods Officer, Communications Officer and Economic and Environment Policy Officer;

Presented by AW

Rangelands and Livelihoods Officer – was advertised and applicants were short-listed. Two strong candidates were identified, with one withdrawing from the process early on (he was offered a position elsewhere) and another being offered the position, on the basis of his strong track record and recommendations. Unfortunately he also withdrew after being provisionally offered the post to pursue politics back in Kenya.

Communications Officer – was advertised and an exceptionally strong candidate identified at interview. However, the candidate was asking for USD3,000 pcm take home, which TNRF cannot currently afford. The Coordinator raised the possibility of TNRF trying to hire the candidate for less and then fundraising (e.g. through the SRT) to meet the difference, but the Steering Committee decided that it was important to stick to the pay-scales currently in operation.

Economic and Environment Policy Officer – was advertised on two separate occasions, and each time a short-listed candidate was offered the position. Both withdrew at the last minute – the first for personal reasons, the second as her current organisation's director fell ill, and her role in the organisation became pivotal for its continued functioning.

7 REVIEW OF ATTAINMENT OF TNRF PRIORITIES FOR 2007 AFTER THE AGM

7.1 Communications and member services and expansion

Presented by AW

This has been begun – a new much-improved website is under development, fundraising is being carried out, human resources recruited and a communications strategy is under development

7.2 Forestry

Presented by AW

The Forest Working Group has now picked up after its strategic planning process earlier on in the year and with some interim funding has been working well to implement the plan it has developed. A part-time consultant was hired to support the Forest Programme Officer, and this arrangement has worked extremely well.

7.3 Communities and WMA Network – DHA proposal;

Presented by AW

Discussions were had with John Balarin of the Danish Hunters' Association about developing a WMA apex association. DHA are keen to approach DanIDA for funding with TNRF facilitating the process. TNRF support to facilitating an apex organisation would potentially provide a more formalised alternative to the community forums under development, for communities in government-sponsored community wildlife management programmes.

Comments

The Committee felt that engagement with this initiative at this juncture premature, given the current capacity of TNRF, and that any engagement be part of another organisation taking the lead.

7.4 Rangelands and Livelihoods – DANIDA & IIED

Presented by AW

A contract has been signed with DanIDA through the Ereto programme to provide funding for the RLTF Programme Officer for two years. In addition, DanIDA is likely to be able to support the RLTF's programmatic activities.

In addition, IIED East Africa Programme has provisionally budgeted support for the Rangelands and Livelihoods position and is proposing that they share office facilities with TNRF. This is now being looked into and a search for new office premises is underway.

7.5 Human and Wildlife Conflict - WCS;

Presented by AW

WCS (Tarangire Elephant Project) have raised funds for a Human Wildlife Conflict working group, and as TNRF Secretariat capacity grows, a programme officer will be recruited later in the year.

7.6 Community-based Tourism – private sector subscription

Presented by AW

Following the successful Community-based Tourism Info-Fair, the Secretariat is looking into developing a subscription process by private sector stakeholders (in particular) for funding a CBT officer. A letter of service offer is being developed and the Secretariat will work to explore the idea further.

8 REGIONAL NETWORK

8.1 East African Wildlife Society Proposal

Presented by AW

The Director of the East African Wildlife Society has proposed that it establish an office in Arusha as a basis for launching and developing its activities in Tanzania. It was strongly suggested by the Coordinator that the EAWLS first scope out a focus to its planned presence in Tanzania, which might best be placed on focussing on trans-boundary issues.

9 VOTE OF THANKS

9.1 Departure of David Erickson to Uzunguni

David Erickson announced that he was leaving Tanzania and moving to Hungary to work with CIC. He thanked Committee members for the opportunity to have served on the Committee and wished TNRF and the Committee all the best in the future.

10 AOB

There being no further business, the meeting was closed by the Chairman.

Signed _____

Chairman

Date: _____

Signed: _____

Secretary

Date: _____