



Recommendations for the National Strategy on Reduced
Emissions from Deforestation and Forest Degradation
(REDD)

Information Brief
December 2009

Tanzania Forestry Working Group



Tanzania Forest
Conservation Group
Shirika la Kuhifadhi
Misitu ya Asili Tanzania



Jumuiko la Maliasili Tanzania
Tanzania Natural Resource Forum

Recommendations for the National Strategy on Reduced Emissions from Deforestation and Forest Degradation

Contents

Introduction	1
Forest Loss and Degradation Today	2
A Vision for REDD in Tanzania	3
Recommendations for Developing the National REDD Strategy	8

Citation: Recommendations for the National Strategy on Reduced Emissions from Deforestation and Forest Degradation (REDD). TFWG Information Brief, 2009.

Cover photo credit: Andrew Perkins, TFCG

© Tanzania Natural Resource Forum 2009

PO Box 15605, Arusha, Tanzania
www.tnrf.org

1. Introduction

In August 2009, the Government of Tanzania published the 'National Framework for Reduced Emissions from Deforestation and Forest Degradation'. The framework is described as a "vision towards development of the National REDD Strategy." Developing a National REDD Strategy which effectively rewards local forest managers, spreads benefits equitably, contributes to poverty reduction, economic development, and biodiversity conservation, and which limits transaction costs is a priority for all stakeholders in Tanzania's forest sector, and particularly for rural communities in forested areas.

This brief, produced through the Tanzania Forestry Working Group, provides recommendations in support of the development of the Tanzania National REDD strategy on the basis of the text provided in the published National Framework for REDD, and in regards to key issues relating to REDD. This is undertaken with a view to contributing to the formulation of an effective and equitable strategy that achieves REDD in Tanzania to the benefit of present and future generations of Tanzanians. This brief has been produced as part of the project "Making REDD work for communities and forest conservation in Tanzania".

REDD presents a major potential opportunity for Tanzania. Tanzania has both high levels of forest cover, with forests that provide a wide range of social, cultural, economic, and ecological benefits. Tanzania also has high rates of deforestation which threaten the sustainability of these valuable forest products and services. Local communities living in highly forested areas are often some of the poorest rural communities in the country with limited opportunities for generating income. By developing a major new external source of revenue attached to maintaining and recovering forests, Tanzania is faced with the opportunity to both improve the condition of its forests and to reduce poverty in forest-resident and forest-adjacent communities. *REDD is therefore a major environmental and economic opportunity for Tanzania. However, REDD also carries considerable risks for the nation and for local communities living in forested landscapes.* There are concerns that REDD, like other natural resource management practices related to timber and wildlife, may not equitably benefit local communities or support their livelihood interests. In order to assist government policy makers and citizens to convert opportunities into reality, while guarding against potential risks, the Tanzania Forestry Working Group has prepared these recommendations for the National REDD Strategy.

Box 1: What is REDD?

Reduced Emissions from Deforestation and Forest Degradation (REDD) has emerged as a central strategy in efforts to reduce global greenhouse gas emissions in order to help prevent climate change. REDD is based on the reality that forests store a great deal of the world's carbon, and an estimated 12-18% of global carbon dioxide emissions come from land use change, mainly deforestation and forest degradation. These processes reduce the amount of carbon dioxide absorbed and stored in trees. Deforestation and forest degradation also release carbon stored by forests into the atmosphere, often through burning or through changes to forest soils and below-ground biomass. Deforestation rates in developing countries tend to be high and make up a large proportion of carbon emissions, particularly from countries

in the tropics with high levels of forest cover. In these countries, timber extraction rates are also high and the timber trade is often not well controlled, causing large scale unrecorded losses of carbon from forests. The idea behind REDD is that the developed countries with high greenhouse gas emissions will pay developing nations to reduce their current rates of deforestation.

2. Forest Loss and Degradation in Tanzania Today

A key question for REDD is: What is the current situation regarding forest use in Tanzania today? In other words, what are the basic overall causes and drivers of deforestation and forest degradation? Since REDD is about changing patterns of forest use and degradation, it is critical to clearly understand where the country stands today if REDD readiness efforts are to address effectively the key issues and challenges. Designing REDD in a way that takes account of underlying drivers of deforestation will be critical to developing an effective REDD strategy.

The National Framework for REDD provides a figure of 412,000 hectares as the rate of annual forest loss in Tanzania, out of a total forest estate of around 35 million hectares. The Framework notes that forest loss and degradation is occurring inside Forest Reserves, but that deforestation is particularly rapid and widespread outside reserved forests. The Framework also notes that insecure tenure over forest land and resources is a key factor in how forests are managed, and that Participatory Forest Management has been able to promote forest recovery by securing forests through local management arrangements.

Forests are being lost at a very high rate in Tanzania today. Forest loss inside Forest Reserves is a result of failure by designated managers to prevent illegal uses. This can be a result of insufficient resources for enforcement, or of corruption which causes laws to be breached deliberately or not enforced.

As the Framework notes, most forest loss occurs outside reserved forests. In these areas forests disappear through several basic processes. Some forests are being cleared through local land use changes, such as shifting cultivation or expansion of agricultural land, which gradually deforests larger and larger areas, particularly in southern and western Tanzania. Often this frontier of deforestation extends out from roads and existing settlements. The demographic expansion of the Tanzanian population, improvements to the transportation infrastructure, and broader global demand for food and agricultural products are all factors driving the conversion of forests and woodland into farmed areas.

Forest degradation is also a major factor in the loss of forest biomass, and consequently, the decrease in carbon storage potential. Degradation comes largely through unsustainable exploitation of forests for charcoal and timber. Trade in charcoal and timber is driven by increasing demand, both in Tanzania and abroad, coupled with insufficient investments in forest conservation at local and national levels.

For both deforestation and forest degradation, insecure forest and land tenure plays an important role. Insecure forest tenure reduces local incentives to conserve forests and encourages short-term exploitation and conversion of forests to other land uses, such as

farms, which are more secure in terms of the land rights such uses confer. In addition, insecurity of land tenure for local people coupled with limited local capacity to protect village land from outside incursion is a factor in the ongoing processes of forest loss.

Box 2: Summary of Drivers of Deforestation in Tanzania

A set of interlinking factors drive forest loss and degradation in Tanzania today:

- Degradation is driven by a rapidly rising demand for forest products. This includes charcoal as an energy source for urban centres such as Dar es Salaam, where charcoal provides the overwhelming majority of household energy supplies. It also includes the globalized trade in timber from forests, which has expanded to encompass a greater number of tree species over the past ten years. This trade is now driven by increasing demand for raw timber from Asia. Governance factors related to tenure underlie both over-exploitation of forests and forest clearance at the local level. Exploitation of timber and charcoal tends to occur in an 'open access' manner. This occurs because the enforcement of restrictions on how forests are used is limited, while traders are exploiting forests as quickly as possible and without incentives to limit use to sustainable levels.
- The clearing of forests for agriculture is due to the lack of an effective integrated approach to natural resource, land use and agricultural policies, resulting in a failure to manage and address a complex and interrelated set of social and bio-physical deforestation drivers. These include the need for new land as the human population continues to grow, compounded by complex land tenure relations in long settled areas, the unmet challenge of adapting to a changing climate, a failure to address long term declines in agricultural productivity and sustainability in many parts of the country, insufficient agricultural intensification in many agricultural areas, and the unmanaged impacts of necessary improvements in infrastructure, such as new roads in the forest frontier areas of southern Tanzania.

3. A Vision for REDD in Tanzania: Towards a National REDD Strategy

The development and publication of the National Framework for REDD is a first step towards developing a more complete National REDD Strategy. In developing this Strategy, and evaluating the existing Framework document, it is important to envision in simple terms what REDD will look like in Tanzania were it to be effectively implemented and operational.

The basic objective of REDD, within the context of the global negotiations over climate change, is to use international financial transfers to reduce the loss and degradation of forests in Tanzania and other developing countries. The central premise of REDD is that those revenues will create the necessary resources and incentives at national, district, village, and household scales for conserving forests by stopping or slowing current trends of forest loss and degradation.

Thus REDD, operating effectively, will consist of the following basic elements:

- The transfer of funds from international sources (either markets or funds) to national and sub-national actors in Tanzania. The funds received will need to be guaranteed sufficiently and be of a volume adequate to provide incentives for forest conservation in light of the competing land use options at local and national levels.
- Actors who conserve forests will be paid based on their performance. These actors or stakeholders may be villages, forest user sub groups below the village level, private landholders or forest managers, district governments, or national management bodies such as the Forestry and Beekeeping Division or Tanzania National Parks (TANAPA). *A key to REDD is that funds need to be channeled to those stakeholders who, in both legal and practical terms, are able to control the way forests are utilized, and therefore are able to conserve those forests.* Funds should be paid over to actors strictly on the basis of results achieved to prevent diversion of funds to purposes other than those to which they were intended.

If the above components are realized, then REDD will convert increased funds for forest conservation into improvements in forest condition, with increased local and national incomes from forest use as an important byproduct of this transaction. If REDD works as intended, forests will become a much more valuable form of rural land use. Rural communities will choose to keep lands forested and will protect forests from degradation, because of the multiple economic values, including but not limited to cash payments made under REDD.

Box 3: REDD and National Policy Objectives

REDD should be designed in a way that maximizes its ability to contribute to Tanzania's overall national development policy goals. REDD has the potential to contribute to economic growth and poverty reduction by generating new forms of economic activity based on forest conservation and by generating direct income for rural communities. REDD should support the overarching objective of MKUKUTA to increase linkages between local livelihoods and the national economy, and to increase income from natural resources for local communities. Mechanisms for benefit-sharing will be critical for REDD to have a positive impact on poverty reduction.

REDD can also contribute to the National Environmental Policy goal to sustainably manage the environment, including support for production of forest-based services such as clean water. In designing REDD, it will be important to remember the provisions of the National Environmental Policy and National Forestry Policy that call for strengthening local land and resource tenure and participation in natural resource management decision making.



The National Framework for REDD provides a generally sound overall vision for REDD, notably in the following passages:

Incentives need to be provided for the effective participation of the stakeholders in the REDD policy. A fair and transparent payment mechanism need[s] to be established in order to provide incentives to stakeholders within the country; in other words, to enable the state to account in a fair way for gains and losses and to reward stakeholders who are responsible for reductions in carbon losses. (Section 2.0, page 6)

A central objective of REDD is to provide sufficient incentives to motivate stakeholders to reverse the effect of threats facing forests. (Section 2.2, page 9)

This is a sound overall vision for REDD, which can be elaborated into a more detailed strategy for how REDD should operate in Tanzania. In order to implement REDD, there are a number of key practical issues that will largely determine if REDD is able to operate in line with the above vision.

First, **land and forest tenure is critical**. As stated above, payments under REDD must be made to those who control forest use and who are best able to protect forests. Local communities and landholders need to have clear rights to manage forests and the products and services (such as carbon sequestration) derived from the forests under their jurisdiction, and to prevent use of forests by people who do not have the legal access rights. **These rights must not only exist under the law, but they must be enforceable**. If tenure is unclear or insecure, or local forest managers cannot enforce their legal rights, then payments made under REDD may not result in improved forest condition. The combined experiences with Participatory Forest Management will provide valuable inputs for this.

Second, payments made under REDD must reflect the real long term value of carbon and they must be made transparently, in a timely manner, and according to established procedures and agreements. Payments must be fairly negotiated between central government and local communities or landholders, and benefits under REDD must account fully for local *transaction costs* - costs of managing forests - and *opportunity costs* - benefits foregone by not replacing forests with agriculture or other land uses. If payments are misused, misappropriated, or made to stakeholders other than those who are managing and conserving forests, then it is unlikely that REDD funds will translate into improved forest condition.

Third, effective systems must be in place to monitor changes in forest condition and carbon storage at all scales -- local, district, and national. Sound, participatory, and transparent monitoring systems will be a key to Tanzania developing a system for REDD that is credible both internationally and with local forest managers. In particular, it will be vital that monitoring data is available easily and openly, through a National Carbon Accounting System, which draws on multiple sources of information.

Box 4: A Checklist of Key Issues for the National REDD Strategy

As the process of developing the National REDD Strategy moves forward, building on the existing National Framework for REDD, a number of key issues will determine if the strategy is going to achieve its aims in an effective and equitable manner. This checklist can serve as a tool for stakeholders to aid discussion and analysis the of strategy as it is being developed.

- Does the strategy build on existing national development and environmental policies and objectives? Is the strategy in harmony with other sectoral policies and laws, such as land laws and environmental policy? Does the policy identify and address any key gaps in the existing policies and laws?
- Does the strategy ensure that it is clearly understood that carbon sequestration is only one in a range of local forest management objectives?
- Does the strategy provide a clear, efficient and equitable framework for sharing and guaranteeing benefits under REDD?
- Does the strategy provide strong incentives for linking achievements in reducing deforestation with benefits received under REDD?
- Does the strategy effectively secure local rights to lands and forests and the economic benefits generated from carbon storage in locally-managed forests?
- Does the strategy have clear and transparent systems in place for independent monitoring and verification including a clear distinction between monitoring and verification? Does the strategy support biodiversity conservation and poverty reduction as outputs of a REDD 'plus' system?
- Has the strategy been developed through a transparent process of public dialogue and participation, including direct input from local forest managers and communities?

4. Recommendations for Developing the National REDD Strategy

Given the above vision for REDD and the current situation with regards to forest use in Tanzania today, this section now provides more detailed commentary and recommendations for the National REDD Strategy. These recommendations are intended to provide the basis for more detailed discussion between policy makers and civil society organizations aimed at getting REDD right for Tanzania.

I. Analysing Root Causes of Deforestation and Forest Degradation

The key to preparing Tanzania for an international arrangement for REDD is to describe how new financing flows under REDD will effectively reverse or abate current high levels of deforestation. In order to do this, it is essential that the underlying root causes

of deforestation are effectively described and analysed. Relative to the National REDD Framework, the National REDD Strategy would benefit from further development in this area.

For example, Table 1 on page 12 of the Framework provides a useful summary of proximate causes of deforestation (e.g. fire, overexploitation, expansion of farms). This should be expanded to incorporate aspects of forest degradation such as illegal trade, and ultimate drivers of deforestation and forest degradation such as were elucidated in the MNRT-TRAFFIC report of 2007 on the timber trade in southern Tanzania. The governance dimensions of deforestation, such as weaknesses in law enforcement, are also excluded in the analysis (see Box 5).

Actions in addition to those called for in relation to REDD Readiness will be required to address the governance constraints to sustainable forest management and the root drivers of deforestation and forest degradation in Tanzania today. If these are the only actions taken to address existing governance challenges in relation to forest management, Tanzania is unlikely to be ready to implement REDD in the near term. *In general, more effort needs to be made to manage and communicate knowledge of the drivers of deforestation and to increase our understanding of the most effective way to address those drivers including measures to increase accountability.*

Box 5: Forest Governance and REDD Readiness

Processes of deforestation and degradation in Tanzania are related to a range of formal and informal governance issues. Reversing existing trends in forest loss and degradation requires existing forest governance challenges be addressed, such as improving local capacity to demand accountability from local, district, and national officials, and to obtain information required to defend and enforce rights over lands and forests. Making payments under REDD will not itself be able to reverse deforestation in Tanzania.

The National Framework for REDD provides a basic analysis of the key governance issues that often underlie deforestation in Tanzania. While the Framework recognizes the critical importance of local land and resource tenure, it does not consider why local resource tenure may be undermined and subverted in practice.

The Framework suggests that Participatory Forest Management (PFM) in Tanzania has been constrained mainly by a lack of funding and capacity. Whilst not ignoring these constraints it is important to acknowledge that, despite large amounts of financial support since the 1990s, PFM has not succeeded in creating strong local incentives for forest conservation mainly because of governance issues. REDD increases the range of markets willing to pay for forest conservation, but does not in itself solve problems of market access. These require a deeper understanding of why, with a very few exceptions, communities have not benefited financially from PFM, including practical weaknesses in local land and forest tenure, and policy implementation gaps in the rule of law and in accountability at village and district levels of government.

The Framework, and REDD readiness efforts in Tanzania in general, are focused on technical issues related to how to monitor and verify changes in carbon stocks, how to prepare baseline scenarios, and how to set up the new organizations required to manage and transfer funds under REDD. These technical issues are important, but on the basis of experiences to date, and as detailed above, they are not sufficient to enabling Tanzania to reach a stage whereby REDD can be successfully implemented in a way that results in more forests, more carbon, and more local economic benefits. Without placing a greater focus on forest governance, REDD is unlikely to achieve its objectives, either for Tanzanian citizens or for global interests in mitigating climate change.

II. Effectively Strengthening PFM

Tanzania's National Forestry Policy recognizes the importance of improving tenure and property rights over forests in order to create local incentives for sustainable use and prevent unsustainable 'open access' exploitation of forests. This realization has been key to supporting the expansion of Participatory Forest Management (PFM) in Tanzania for the past 15 years. The premise of PFM is that by clarifying village rights to forests and forest benefits, including the right to capture economic benefits from forests in the future in a secure legal manner, local communities will invest in conserving forests out of their own interest. There is ample evidence across Tanzania that PFM has created local incentives to conserve forests by securing local rights over forests, leading to forest recoveries in many areas, including recovery of the carbon stocks of these forests. It is also documented that where PFM has been developed and villages have secure rights over forests, they may restrict levels of locally-licensed harvesting for products such as charcoal to sustainable levels of off-take.

While the National Framework for REDD recognizes the importance of PFM in reversing forest degradation, the Framework does not discuss or analyse the existing shortcomings and limitations of PFM as experienced in Tanzania to date. The Framework does note that "The current speed under which PFM projects are established is also observed to be very low" (Section 2.4, page 11). However, the Framework has not developed a sufficient analysis of what factors are currently limiting the spread of PFM. This will be critical for developing an effective National REDD Strategy.

In particular, two key shortcomings facing PFM and limiting its scale to date have been:

- a) limited economic benefits captured under PFM, including weaknesses in the benefit-sharing formula for forest products under joint forest management (JFM) in areas jointly managed between local communities and either central or district government;
- b) challenges in securing and enforcing local rights under PFM, including conflicts of interest related to securing control over forests and forest products amongst different local, district, and national stakeholders. *The critical role of local rights over forests in relation to PFM outcomes need to be highlighted in the National REDD strategy if it is to provide an effective framework for developing REDD in Tanzania.*

III. Local Land and Forest Tenure

The Framework document provides sound focus on issues of local tenure and PFM, and explicitly recognizes the importance of secure tenure in relation to forest conservation. This builds on the focus on tenure in the National Forestry Policy and in the years of developing PFM in the forestry sector.

The Framework states that most forests outside reserved areas are on 'General Lands'. Existing maps and documentation of village land areas in Tanzania, along with the definition of village lands provided in the Village Land Act, suggest otherwise. For example, maps of Kilwa District provided by the Ministry of Lands and the Kilwa District Council show lands within the demarcated boundaries of registered villages as covering all the land in the district except for reserved lands (e.g. Forest Reserves). In most cases, there is no empty, unused, or undemarcated land in this heavily forested district, as is generally the case with all districts across Tanzania. Most forests are on village lands, even if they have not been formally designated as Village Land Forest Reserves. It is important for the Framework to recognize this reality and build its REDD strategy accordingly.

For example, the Framework states:

Most of the villages are not yet registered and their lands may be categorized as General Lands. (Section 2.4.3, page 14)

This statement would have been true before the enactment of the afore-mentioned land laws, but a more precise legal terminology is necessary to conform with the current land policy and situation. The Framework also says that most "villages are not yet registered". This should be clarified to state that many villages do not have registered Village Land Certificates. The villages themselves must be registered otherwise they could not formally exist under the Local Government legislation. It is also important to state that, for land to be categorized as 'village land', that land does not have to be formally surveyed or registered; the Village Land Act and Land Act provide that customary rights of occupancy, as exist in village lands, are not dependent on such formal procedures, but provide a wide scope for defining village lands. These provisions make for excellent laws which formalize existing rights over customary lands, much admired in other countries, and ensure that PFM can proceed without formal demarcation of village lands. The REDD Strategy should seek to build on this.

IV. Key Design Issues

The Framework does not provide clarity on some key issues related to REDD. Examples of these include design issues related to a 'nested' versus a solely 'national' approach (which appears to be the preference in the Framework although this is not clearly stated) and issues related to fund-based or market-based design for REDD. Some of the key design issues related to REDD are explored in a second information brief.

Making REDD work for communities and forest conservation in Tanzania

The Tanzania Forest Conservation Group and MJUMITA - the Tanzanian Community Forest Conservation Network - are leading a group of civil society organizations to make REDD work for Tanzania through a new project funded by the Royal Norwegian Embassy.

The project aims to reduce greenhouse gas emissions from deforestation and degradation in Tanzania in ways that provide direct and equitable incentives to communities to conserve and manage forests sustainably. The project will achieve this by supporting the development of a Community Carbon Cooperative hosted within the existing Network of Tanzanian

communities engaged in participatory forest management. The Cooperative will aggregate voluntary emission from its members and market them according to internationally recognised standards. Project funds and carbon market revenue will be channelled directly to the communities based on results, thereby maximising incentives to maintain forest cover and reduce deforestation.

This publication forms part of the project's strategic advocacy component aimed at forging a smooth path for REDD in Tanzania by engaging in the formulation of REDD frameworks and processes at national and international level.

The Tanzania Forestry Working Group

The Tanzania Forestry Working Group (TFWG), has met regularly since August 2005. The TFWG was formed to address advocacy and awareness raising on critical forest management and governance issues in Tanzania. The TFWG is supported and facilitated by TNRF, but depends on the members of the group to set the agenda and carry out activities.

Members of the group are all involved in forest management issues, either as organisations or as individuals interested in forest management in Tanzania.

As part of its work, the group has developed a series of collaborative projects to advance its goals of improved forest management and governance. These collaborative projects include a major campaign on promoting awareness at local and national level on forest governance - in response to pressing

issues, such as illegal and unsustainable logging and charcoal making. Other related issues include the need to expedite the implementation of participatory forest management, and tracking the reform of the forestry sector in Tanzania.

The TFWG worked for and has taken on facilitating Independent Forest Management - as a means for better understanding how much progress is being made in improving forest law enforcement and governance.

TFWG also holds round table discussions on 'Reduced Emissions from Deforestation and Degradation' which provide practitioners in Tanzania with the opportunity to share experiences and learn from each other about how best to advance their projects benefiting forest conservation and rural livelihoods.